

PERSONNEL STUDY

TOWN OF SIMSBURY, CT

COMPLETED BY

LEE C. ERDMANN

NOVEMBER 10, 2014

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
ASSIGNMENT	3
APPROACH	4
COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS	5
FINDINGS	15
OPTIONS ANALYSIS	17
RECOMMENDATIONS	19
APPENDICES	
A. JOB CONTENT QUESTIONNAIRES	
B. PRIMARY RESPONSIBILITIES CHART	
C. PERSONNEL PRIMARY RESPONSIBILITIES WORKSHEET	
D. JOB DESCRIPTIONS	

ASSIGNMENT

The assignment is to examine the roles and responsibilities of the positions involved in the Personnel function in the town of Simsbury, CT and to recommend any appropriate changes in these roles and responsibilities in light of the town charter provision providing for the delegation of the Personnel functions to administrative staff. This study recognizes that, pursuant to Section 501 of the Charter of the Town of Simsbury, the 1st Selectman serves as the full-time Chief Executive and Chief Administrative Officer of the Town. The recommendations herein are designed to ensure that any changes to the assignment of the personnel functions remain consistent with this mandate.

APPROACH

The approach to this study has been to have the Director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services complete Job Content Questionnaires, prepare a summary of Personnel Primary Responsibilities, interview the 1st Selectman, the Director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services, conduct a comparative analysis of up to twelve comparative towns, develop a set of draft findings, options and recommendations, prepare a draft report, review the draft report with the Director of Administrative Services, and make any corrections, deletions and additions needed, prepare a final draft report, review the final draft report with the Personnel subcommittee of the Board of Selectmen and with the full Board of Selectmen and submit a final report to the Director of Administrative Services.

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

I have collected full information from nine and partial information from three of the twelve comparative towns identified by the town of Simsbury's Personnel Sub-Committee for use in preparation of market reference ranges and other compensation purposes. As only one of those towns utilizes the 1st Selectman form of government, ten additional towns have been included, with full information for nine of them and partial information for the other two. Hence, the draft report is based on full information collected from Simsbury and from seventeen comparative towns. The final report includes the same information.

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS
PERSONNEL POSITIONS

TOWN	POP	FTEs	HR FTE's	POSITIONS INVOLVED IN PERSONNEL FUNCTION	COMPREHE HR SYSTEM
AVON	18,283	105	2.0	HR DIRECTOR SR. ADMIN ANALYST	AUC
BLOOMFD	20,602		3.0	HR DIRECTOR HR GENERALIST HR SPECIALIST	-
BRISTOL	60,603	499	4.0	PERSONNEL DIRECTOR ASSISTANT PERS DIR PERSONNEL ANALYST SR. ADMIN ASST	-
CANTON	10,351	69	1.0	CHIEF ADMIN OFFICER FINANCE DIRECTOR 2 ADMIN ASSTS	-
DARIEN	21,114		1.0	HR DIRECTOR	-
EAST HAV	29,190	225	2.5	CHIEF EXAMINER CSC ASST DIR ADM & MGMT STAFF ACCOUNTANT	-
FAIRFLD	60,450	706	4.0	HR DIRECTOR BENEFITS MANAGER RISK MANAGER HR ADMIN ASST	-
FARMTN	25,529	167	2.0	TOWN MANAGER ASST TOWN MANAGER DIR FINANCE & ADM ADM ASST	-
GLASTBY	34,698	141	3.0	TOWN MANAGER DIR HR HR GENERALIST	MUNIS

			ADM SECRETARY	
GRANBY	11,316 56	1.2	TOWN MANAGER HS DIR, ADM FIN DIR	-
GREENWH	62,256		HR DIRECTOR	
HAMDEN	60,863 438	4.0	PERS & CS DIRECTOR HR OFFICER ADMIN SECRETARY BENEFITS TECHNICIAN	-
NW CANA	20,110 180		HR DIRECTOR PAYROLL & BENEFITS COOR PENSION ADM	-
NEWINGT	30,602			
ROCKY HL	19,729			
SIMSBURY	23,620	1.1	DIR ADM SERVICES DEP DIR ADM SVS	NEOGOV
SO WINDS	25,835 177	1.3	TOWN MANAGER ASST TO THE T. M.	ADP
SOTHINGT	43,434			
STRATFD	52,077 439	4.0	HR DIRECTOR 2 HR GENERALISTS JR HR GENERALIST	-
WALNGFD	45,179 464	7.0	PERSONNEL DIRECTOR ASST PERS DIRECTOR RISK MANAGER EXECUTIVE SEC SECRETARY PERS TECHNICIAN PERS CLERK	-
WEST HTFD	63,274 442	6.5	HR EXEC DIR ASST DIR EMPL SVS EXEC ASST	ABRA SUITE

2 HR SPECIALISTS

WESTPORT	27,068 286	3.3	PERSONNEL DIRECTOR PERSONNEL ADMIN PAYROLL & BEN COOR ACCTS PAYABLE CLERK	-
WETHSFD	26,710	.4	TOWN MANAGER EXEC SECRETARY	-

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS-SALARY RANGES OF POSITIONS INVOLVED IN THE PERSONNEL FUNCTION
POSITIONS AND SALARY RANGES

<u>TOWN</u>	<u>POP</u>	<u>TM/CHAO</u>	<u>ATM/DEPUTY CAO</u>	<u>ASSIST TO THE TM</u>	<u>MAYOR/ 1ST SELECT</u>	<u>DIR ADM SVS</u>
AVON	18,283	143,816	82,082			
BRISTOL	60,603				100,445	
BLOOMFD	20,602	140,000	68,526-105,775			
CANTON	10,351					122,286
DARIEN	21,114	159,625				
EAST HAV	29,190	75,000				
FAIRFLD	60,450		62,050		127,600	
FARMGT	25,529	148,065	84,553-95,223			
GLASTBY	34,698	169,595				
GRANBY	11,316	148,500				
GREENWH	62,256	117,372	102,230			120,300
HAMDEN	60,863	90,000	70,000			

NW CANA	20,110	130,397	130,333
NEWGTON	30,602	139,000	
ROCKY HL	19,729	148,386	
SIMSBURY	23,620		104,508
SO WINDS	25,835	157,259	65,183-115,542
SOUTHGT	43,434	151,900	146,343
STRATFD	52,077	120,000	101,530
WALNGFD	45,179		73,140
WEST HTFD	63,274	150,000	
WESTPORT	27,068		101,050
WETHSFD	26,710	123,600	87,562

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS-SALARY RANGES OF POSITIONS INVOLVED IN THE PERSONNEL FUNCTION
POSITIONS AND SALARY RANGES

<u>TOWN</u>	<u>POP</u>	<u>DEP DIR ADM SVS</u>	<u>HR DIRECTOR</u>	<u>HR ASST DIR</u>	<u>DIR FIN & ADM</u>	<u>RISK MANAGER</u>
AVON	18,283		98,354			
BRISTOL	60,603		122,970			90,697
BLOOMFID	20,602		79,287-122,380			
CANTON	10,351					
DARIEN	21,114		119,000			
EAST HAV	29,190					69,910
FAIRFLD	60,450		115,299			93,050
FARMGT	25,529				113,048-128,114	
GLASTBY	34,698		80,886-109,219			
GRANBY	11,316		88,152			
GREENWH	62,256		167,517	119,203		
HAMDEN	60,863		90,000	35,000		75,000
NW CANA	20,110		112,370			

NEWGTON	30,602		
ROCKY HL	19,729		
SIMSBURY	23,620	65,000-95,000	
SO WINDS	25,835		
SOTHGTON	43,434		
STRATFD	52,077	96,063	
WALNGFD	45,179	125,663	
WEST HTFD	63,274	80,990-143,988	92,196-114,244
WESTPORT	27,068	117,700	
WETHSFD	26,710		

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS-SALARY RANGES OF POSITIONS INVOLVED IN THE PERSONNEL FUNCTION
POSITIONS AND SALARY RANGES

<u>TOWN</u>	<u>POP</u>	<u>HR GENERALIST</u>	<u>HR SPEC/ASST</u>	<u>ADM ASST/ADM SEC 11/EXEC ASST</u>	<u>BEN COOR</u>
AVON	18,283				
BRISTOL	60,603			53,263	
BLOOMFD	20,602	56,111-70,252	39,803-49,832		
CANTON	10,351			49,500	
DARIEN	21,114				
EAST HAV	29,190				
FAIRFLD	60,450			45,600	
FARMGT	25,529			56,233-63,328	
GLASTBY	34,698	54,424-68,074		42,646-53,371	
GRANBY	11,316				
GREENWH	62,256			74,055	
HAMDEN	60,863			55,000	
NW CANA	20,110			60,752	

NEWGTN	30,602	61,251
ROCKY HL	19,729	70,000
SIMSBURY	23,620	
SO WINDS	25,835	
SOTHGTN	43,434	51,146
WALNGFD	45,179	73,474
WEST HTFD	63,274	
WESTPORT	27,068	
WETHSFD	26,710	
		45,564-58,682

71,786-95,966

FINDINGS

1. The five primary responsibilities in the personnel function are union contract negotiations and administration, human resources program development and administration, employee benefits and pension plan administration, general employment matters, and recruitment.
2. In Simsbury, the Director of Administrative Services spends 50% of his time and the Deputy Director of Administrative Services spends 65% of his time on the five primary responsibilities in the personnel function. This represents 1.15 full time equivalent (FTE). This is the third lowest of the comparable towns and is inadequate to properly handle these responsibilities.
3. In Simsbury, the Deputy Director of Administrative Services spends 25% of his time and the Director of Administrative Services spends 10% of his time on employee benefits/pension plan administration. The town has hired a consultant to assist in this area to provide relief to the Deputy Director who also temporarily served as Acting Finance Director.
4. In Simsbury, the 1st Selectman provides oversight and policy direction to the personnel function and retains final authority with respect to personnel decisions. The 1st Selectman is responsible for the supervision and review of department heads and supervisors. The Director of Administrative Services, who has extensive background and practiced labor and employment law for many years, has oversight of the day-to-day human resources and personnel function. The addition of this skill set and the addition of a Deputy Director of Administrative Services with an MPA have professionalized the human resources function.
5. Simsbury has fewer FTE's devoted to the personnel function than all but three of the comparative towns.
6. Eleven of the expanded list of twenty-two comparative towns have the Mayor/Council or the Selectmen/Town Meeting form of government.
7. In Simsbury, the Director of Administrative Services and the Deputy Director of Administrative Services positions have evolved into top-level professional positions with significant responsibility for day-to-day management of town affairs.
8. In Simsbury, over the past six years, the 1st Selectman has placed emphasis on professionalizing the town staff. As a result, the town has benefitted from cost savings and program improvements in the human resources and benefits areas such as the following:
 - a. Union contract negotiations are being conducted by in-house staff with minimal use of outside labor counsel, resulting in a reduction in legal fees and more timely favorable contract terms.
 - b. Internal insurance and pension plan audits have been conducted, identifying and correcting discrepancies.

- c. Defined contribution plans have been introduced and changes have been made to pension plan administration to ensure pension plan viability.
 - d. A specific risk management function has been introduced.
 - e. Health insurance plans have been consolidated resulting in cost savings and avoidance totaling \$500,000.
 - f. OSHA, workers compensation and safety committee functions have been upgraded.
 - g. An on-line hiring process has been instituted resulting in considerable time and cost savings.
9. In Simsbury, the town administration currently conducts performance appraisals.
10. Section 502 of the Town of Simsbury's Charter provides that:
The First Selectman shall be the Personnel Director for the Town, and shall have the responsibility for developing job descriptions for all administrative officers, subject to the approval of the Board of Selectmen; and all advertising for, hiring, and dismissal of Town employees, except Board of Education employees, shall be under the First Selectman's direct control, subject to the approval of the Board of Selectmen, provided, however, that the appointment and removal of officers and employees of the Police Department shall be governed by the provisions of Section 707 of this Charter. **Notwithstanding the foregoing, the First Selectman may, with the consent of the Board of Selectmen, appoint another Town officer to the position of Personnel Director. Upon such appointment, the appointed Town officer shall perform the duties of the personnel director as described in this section.**

Full delegation of the human resources function is therefore permissible under the terms of the Charter, according to the Director of Administrative Services after conferring with counsel.

11. The positions of Director of Administrative Services and Deputy Director of Administrative Services are not identified in the Town of Simsbury's Charter. These positions serve at the discretion of the 1st Selectman.
12. The Charter of one comparable community provides for the delegation of the personnel function to staff.

OPTIONS ANALYSIS

<u>OPTION</u>	<u>ADVANTAGES</u>	<u>DISADVANTAGES</u>
1. Full delegation of final personnel decisions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- provided for in charter- day to day functions are delegated- provides further professionalization- 1st Selectman not required to be a trained professional or to have human resources experience- shortens decision making process and timeline- potential to retain professional staff	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- lessens responsibility of 1st Selectman
2. Partial delegation of final personnel decisions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- provided for in charter- day-to-day functions are delegated- provides further professionalization- 1st Selectman typically not a trained professional- somewhat shortens decision making process and timeline- potential to retain professional staff- 1st Selectman receives recommendations and makes final decisions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- somewhat lessens responsibility of 1st Selectman
3. No delegation of final personnel decisions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- maintains status quo- maintains final personnel decision making authority with 1st Selectman	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- burden on 1st Selectman- does not shorten decision making process and timeline- may lose highly trained professional staff

OPTION 1

Full delegation of the personnel function to professional staff would be a very important step forward for the town of Simsbury. Full delegation would effectively mean that authority currently invested in the 1st Selectman for hiring, firing, conducting performance appraisals and determining raises and discipline would be formally delegated to the director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services. The 1st Selectman would continue to have oversight and provide policy guidance in these areas but would no longer have final decision-making authority in these areas. As required by Charter, the 1st Selectman would continue to function as the Chief Operating Officer responsible for the direction of the business of the town. All of the town's department heads, including the Director of Administrative Services would continue to report to the 1st Selectman. As the Chief Operating Officer the 1st Selectman would prepare the annual performance review for the Director of Administrative Services. The director of Administrative Services would perform the role of Personnel Director at the pleasure of the 1st Selectman and the Board of Selectmen,

OPTION 2

Partial delegation of the personnel function to professional staff would essentially represent delegation of some of the final decisions currently made by the 1st Selectman. Perhaps the conducting of performance appraisals, determining raises and determining discipline could be delegated to the Director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services but other decisions such as hiring and firing would continue to be made by the 1st Selectman.

OPTION 3

No delegation of the personnel function to professional staff would mean continuation of the status quo. Final decision making authority for hiring, firing, conducting performance appraisals, determining raises and determining disciplinary action would remain with the 1st Selectman.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The 1st Selectman should partially delegate the personnel function to the Director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services. This would be another step in the direction of professionalizing the town administration and would fully recognize the capabilities of the professional staff. Although this would lessen the authority and responsibility of the 1st Selectman, it would further the professionalization of the town staff, help to retain the existing professional staff and speed up the decision making process. The salary ranges of the Director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services should be increased appropriately. The salary range of the 1st Selectman could be adjusted downward as appropriate.
2. The town of Simsbury should create a third position having responsibilities in the personnel function. Responsibilities in the area of employee benefits and pension plan administration are currently handled by a temporarily full time consultant. Although the consultant was hired initially to provide relief to the Deputy Director of Administrative Services who temporarily served as Acting Finance Director, this area is very complex and deserves considerably more attention than the Director and Deputy Director of Administrative Services have been able to devote to it. Appropriate titles range from Employee Benefits Specialist to Employee Benefit Generalist to Employee Benefits Coordinator or Administrator with a salary range of \$55,000 to \$75,000. This would give the town 2 FTE's in the personnel function which is more in line with comparable communities.
3. While the Town Charter permits the delegation of the personnel function by the 1st Selectman and thereby makes professionalization of town staff possible, the town's human resources staff members are not included in or identified by the Charter and currently serve at the discretion of the 1st Selectman. Further Charter revisions should be considered to make the proposed delegation permanent provided that the delegation remains subject to the approval of the 1st Selectman and the Board of Selectmen. This will ensure that the town's commitment to professionalism is permanent and cannot be undone at the whim of future 1st Selectmen; and that both existing and future staff can be assured of the stability of the function which will help the town to recruit and retain the best candidates.